Heritage 2010
Heritage and Sustainable Development

Proceedings of the 2nd International Conference
on Heritage and Sustainable Development
Evora, Portugal
22-26 June

Edited by
Rogério Amoêda
Sérgio Lira
Cristina Pinheiro

green lines institute
for sustainable development
Contents

Volume I

Foreword v
Organizing Committee vii
Scientific Committee ix
Partners and Sponsors xi
Contents

Chapter 1 - Heritage and Governance for Development
Insights into volunteer management: the case of the UK heritage tourism sector
Achiriasa, A. & Harwell, J. 3

Values-based management at cultural heritage sites
Atienburg, K. F. 11

Local heritage as a development asset? The case of the island Hvar in Croatia
Belyaev, D. 19

Politics in command: public participation and sustainable development of built heritage in Macao
Chen, B. K. P. 29

Protecting farming landscapes and their antiquities
Crimin, A. C. & Johnson, A. W. 37

Management of local development based on cultural heritage appraisal – itineraries of cultural tourism
Djukanović, D. 43
Assam’s Xatras as repositories of cultural heritage
Dutta, N. 53
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable heritage conservation of Islamic Cairo district</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Sorady, D. A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A new critical framework for Azorean-American stories</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eldred, J. C. M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A world heritage trilogy: a comparative analysis of tourism issues,</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>expectations, realities and challenges at three world heritage sites</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in rural Nova Scotia, Canada</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>George, E. W.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban renaissance in Guzzi, the old industrial centre of Athens</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gerasimou, S.; Veneti, E. &amp; Zournatzidou, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revitalizing historic Cairo: examining policies and implementation</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghrib, R. Y.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rammed-earth walls in Seville in the modern age. Technical, material</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>and sustainable features</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graciani, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heritage conservation in Bosnia and Herzegovina</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gut, M. &amp; Hudovic, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historic and environmental significance of ecological communities</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in NSW, Australia</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haedoun, P. A. &amp; Clements, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture heritage conservation programs in Malawi and public responses</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jawaleyi, Y. M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tradition of conservation: redefining authenticity in Japanese</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>architectural conservation in Rwanda, T.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The challenge of governance in historic urban environments</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Landorf, C.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Final scientific balance and maintenance of architectural Heritage</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leonge, F.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Climate change and heritage: responding to the crisis</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long, C. &amp; Smith, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modernization and self-glorification: the governance of archaeological</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>heritage in Guangzhou, South China</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lu, T. L.-D.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Catalog of built heritage: study and protection of regionalist</td>
<td>189</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>architecture of Seville</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mascort, Geraldine, E.; Jaramillo Morillo, A.; Mascort Albén, E.;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ruiz Jaramillo J. &amp; Mascot Alben, M. A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cultural heritage in urban regeneration: complexity and uncertainty</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>in the evaluation process for valorisation of sites</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matairo, A. &amp; Ferri, B.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Challenges and conflicts of heritage protection in post-communist</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>countries: the case of the Jewish Quarter in Budapest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pap, A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Governance: politics as grounds for ‘common heritage of humanity’</td>
<td>219</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ramos, C. T.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Which heritage</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reed, A. M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wine as intangible Canada</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rijnooieter, M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Revealing the V.</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodgers, A. P.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The cultural sig</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silva, A. T. &amp; Rec</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law as (in) co-universality as</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Soderland, H. A.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enhancing the</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speckens, A. H.;</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A study of the r</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>island chain</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tseng, A. C.-C.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 - H</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The third pig: br</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Groves, D.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Globalization, m</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maturo, A. &amp; Co.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues in educati</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staniforth, M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 - He</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable comm</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tunbridge, J.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ephesos in a capi</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aktare, Z.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The value of cult</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ambrecht, J.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Historical heritage</td>
<td>163</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Saxon villages in</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balan, D.; Popesor</td>
<td>173</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Towards a politics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cerman, J.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The role of experts</td>
<td>181</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corquetti, M.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Contents

Which heritage? The construction of place in Ghana’s tourism
Reed, A. M. 227

Wine as intangible heritage: preliminary thoughts on meaning and landscape in Niagara Region, Canada
Rippecester, M. & Johnston, R. 237

Revealing the World Heritage cities and their varied natures
Rodas, A. P. 245

The cultural significance of World Heritage cities: Portugal as case study
Silva, A. T. & Rodas, A. P. 255

Law as (in) compatible interlocutor in sustainable heritage governance: appraising jurisprudential universality as heritage management tool
Sederland, H. A. 265

Enhancing the outstanding universal value assessment practices of Willemstad
Speckers, A. H.; Pereira Roda, A. R. & Gonzalez-Manuel, C. 271

A study of the reuse of old building materials in the sustainable conservation of villages at Matsu Island chain
Tsang, A. C.-C. & Fu, B. C.-C. 283

Chapter 2 - Heritage and Education Policies

The third pig: brick construction in Australia
Groves, D. 293

Globalization, multi-ethnic society and sustainable development
Munro, A. & Contini, R. M. 305

Issues in education in maritime archaeology
Stanforth, M. 315

Chapter 3 - Heritage and Economics

Sustainable communities: the roles of heritage and tourism
Tunbridge, J. 325

Ephesus in a capitalist world
Aktirez, Z. 333

The value of cultural institutions: A review and conceptual development of value categories
Ambrseeh, J. 343

Historical heritage and sustainable development of the local communities: the case study of the Saxon villages in Transylvania

Towards a political economy of heritage
Cammar, J. 361

The role of experiential marketing in the management of Italian local cultural heritage
Cequtiti, M. 365
XVI

Heritage 2010 - Heritage and Sustainable Development
R. Amoêda, S. Lira & C. Pinheiro (eds.)

Appropriation of world heritage in Mozambique Island
Donas e Sá, V. U.

Implementation of intangible cultural heritage to achieve sustainable development strategy: in autonomous cultural district
El Faddi, B. R. A.

The impact of sustainability rating tools & legislation on the conservation of 20th century urban fabric in NSW, Australia
Faddy, J. A.

Research on cultural tourism development in sacred and spiritual sites from the UNESCO World Heritage List
Goral, A.

Spa heritage and rural development
Sánchez Ferré, J.

Integrated cluster of centralized heritage-based nano-economies in the High Mountains of Sinai Peninsula
Shams, A.

The dilemma in turkish highlands: preservation of natural and cultural heritage and tourism development - A case study of the eastern Black Sea region
Somancu, M.

Regional identity and heritage: baltic way to raise competitiveness
Stokmane, I.

Chapter 4 - Heritage and Environment

Sustainable tourism in Western Newfoundland, Canada: island destination and peripheral communities
Addo, E.

Conservation of historical buildings and building deconstruction: maximizing preservation and minimizing materials flow
Amoêda, R. & Pinheiro, C.

Who's driving the green agenda? Identifying the key factors influencing the adoption of resource efficient design strategies within the museum and heritage sector
Chippis, R. S. G. & Witheford, S.

Parque do Flamengo: heritage in movement
Costa, L. M. S. A.; D. B. P. Machado & R. L. Cavallazzi

Reconstruction possibilities of the roman villas – unshattering methods in the safeguarding and in the conservation
Fermigl, A.

Geological risk around the Tito Bustillo and El Castillo prehistoric caves. North of Spain
Foyo, A.; Tomillo, C.; Sánchez, M. A. & Foyo, C.

Charles Deering - entrepreneur, environmental pioneer and art patron
Fromm, A. B.
Contents

Preserving the unsustainable sustainably – historic town planning and current planning issues in the World Heritage area of the Semmering railway exemplified by Reichenau an der Rax
Fuchs, B. 507

The resilience and care of ancient stone monuments in changing environments
Giesen, M. J.; Mierle, A. D.; Umhahn, D. W. & Warke P. A. 515

Renovation of an ancient Bosporus village: Ortaköy
Göken, E. G. & Tekincci, E. O. 525

Reinterpreting the value of built heritage for sustainable development
Jackson, P. & Iyer-Raniga, U. 535

Adaptation of the historic built environment to climate change
Lino, H. & Jones, K. 547

The effect of the variations of temperature and pluviometry on heritage property of the archdiocese of Seville (Spain)
Moeses Bernal, J. M. 557

Comparative analysis of constructive solutions for thermal insulation by using computer applications in building rehabilitation in Mediterranean climate. The Spanish case
Mateo García, M.; Piedadanza García, B. & Pérez Carrasmilana, C. 563

Sustainable wood construction: its natural protection
Monés Méndez, E. & Ruiz Jaramillo, J. 571

Eating, jiggling or watching? Ocean heritage and sustainable development

Energy efficiency and preservation in our cultural heritage in Halland, Sweden
Norström, H. & Edén, M. 589

Renewal and enhancement of natural and built heritage in rural areas: a greenways network for a sustainable management strategy
Oppo, S. 601

Sustainable touristic development in marginal landscapes: The Mills Valley in Osilo (Sardinia)
Piratella, P. & Spreadda, F. 611

The health and environmental benefits of using traditional historic finishes
Risso, J. S. 621

The manifold shell
Spreddda, P. & Serra, A. 631

Cultural infrastructures in Veneto. Earth and water pathways in the landscapes of the archaeology
Vanoni, M. 641

Developing urban heritage through the experience of Piazza Caribaldi in Naples
Violà, S.; Diana, D.; Napolitano, T. & De Jonna, P. 651

Energy efficiency and environmental impacts of building with heritage values in Australia
What do the ancient Chinese teach us? – A case study of Chinese courtyard house on sustainable architectural design
Yang, J. & Zhu, Y.

Heritage tourism development preference among residents in Danish-Osu, Ghana
Yankohome, A. K. B.

Index of Authors

Volume 2

Foreword
Organizing Committee
Scientific Committee
Partners and Sponsors
Contents

Chapter 5 - Heritage and Culture

New challenges and strategies for the study and safeguard of cultural heritage - the Instituto dos Museus e da Conservação experience
Amador, J. M. & Candelas, A. E.

Genres of authenticity: byzantine monastery tourism/pilgrimage
Andreou, K.

Analysis of the built environment structures in Ferrara
Arbizzani, E.

National politics and cultural sustainability: the case of the Mevlevi Sema ceremony of Turkey
Aykub, B.

Cemetery and heritage – the background of a case study
Bissa, L. & Kiss, F.

The heritage of stereotomy, and its new perspectives for building in a sustainable way
Bergamo, F. & Liva, G.

Creating heritage to preserve it: the iemoto system in Japan as model
Cang, V. G.

The knowledge for urban recovery. The district of Saint Maria Maggiore in Agira (EN)
Carione, P. & Giuffrida, A.

Coping with two World Heritages. The two UNESCO declarations and local identity in Elche
Carmona-Zahiri, D. & Nogués-Pedregal, A. M.

The cultural heritage issues in developing countries, case study: Lapethos
Caazova, L.; Caazova, N.; Erdeljan, A. & Ulbar, U.
From food festival to food heritage - the formation of local identity: a case of Mullet Roe in Taiwan
Chang, M. Y. & Chu, C. 787

From foodways to intangible heritage: a case study of Chinese culinary resource, recipes and restaurants
Chang, S. C. H. 795

Discourse and production in Macau's culture of heritage: a decade after the Handover
Chang, T. 801

Preventive conservation - a sustainable approach to cultural heritage preservation
Cioello, C. M. T. & Brum, C. V. C. 813

The price of freedom. A country in decadence: the rapid loss of tangible heritage in Albania
Cortesi, I. 821

Heritage and its cultural boundaries: challenging the western paradigm by means of the example of China
Dede, W. 827

Fragile heritages: an architecture between disappearance and reutilisation
Dominguez Casadevall, G. 837

Managing knowledge and building quality as a sustainable strategy in cultural heritage
Draxel, A. 845

The contemporary way to protecting heritage or, the only way for heritage to serve the development of communities
Duarte, A. 855

Different aspects of a living heritage: spice bazaar in Istanbul
Durhan, S. & Orgiuven, Y. 865

A knowledge-sharing space to document the spirit of place: A case study of neighborhoods in Beirut
El-Khouary, N. & De Paoli, G. 875

Material imagination and religious architecture in Saskatchewan
Fai, S. 883

Cultural landscapes and tourism in the Atlantic: the case of Madeira Island
Fernandes, F. 891

Heritage sustainable conservation: the Romanesque itinerary on the River Sousa
Ferreira, T. C. 901

Safeguarding historical and cultural continuity: integrating sustainable tourism, development, and heritage in UNESCO designated "Old Town" Lunenburg
Field, R. 913

Salisbury as palimpsest – meaning, order and progress in the evolution of a modern city
Frost, C. W. 917

Cultural landscape, alternative for sustainable development in Michoacan, Mexico
Fuentes Farias, F. J. 927
Tourism and sustainable heritage: The case of Valldemossa monastery in Mallorca (Spain)  
Gambris, M. & Banóč de Minhäuser, C.  
933

Lumahai heritage in museums and on country: the changing contexts of identity  
Hafner, D.  
941

The Church of the Assumption in Bia, Spain. A study on its present condition.  
Huesca Tortosa, J. A.; Spinarini Berrio, Y.; Louis Cereceda, M. & Prado Govea, R.  
951

Japanese tourists' motivation for visiting cultural and heritage sites in the UK  
Jirina, T.  
959

Separation or procrastination? A retrospective on indigenous-industrial heritage conflicts in Perth and Ottawa  
Jones, R. & Birdwell-Jones, C.  
969

Hungarian heritage of the 18th century monastic garden art – history and sustainability  
KMagyári, M.  
977

Cultural heritage of wood carvings as Taorajian identity and social value in daily life  
Lee-Nimmoja, H. S.  
987

Museums planning and programming: towards heritage sustainability  
Lin, S.  
997

The historical monument as an integral part of urban surroundings: Sustainable redevelopment around El Hogar del Comandante Aguado (Teneru)  
Macías Gutiérrez, V.; Martínez Sierra, E. & Macías Hamalainen, C.  
1005

The setting of architectural heritage in Portugal  
Marado, C. A. & Correia, L. M.  
1015

Cistercian architecural heritage as cultural landmarks  
Marins, A. M. T.  
1023

Local foodways as intangible heritage in India: the role of chefs and restaurants in preserving Gujrani culinary ways  
Matsuka, K.  
1035

Residential cultural heritage: constructing symbolic capital in the urban space  
Michelson, A. & Paal, T.  
1041

Living on the historical edges: spatial analysis for Arab historical walled cities, Alexandria as a case study  
Mohamed, N. & Kronenburg, R.  
1051

Urban impact of cultural tourism  
Morales Gutiérrez, A.  
1061

The Azorean identity and heritage through the Holy Ghost festival  
Neto, G. H.  
1071

Liffis as cultural heritage  
Nicolae, I.  
1079

e-Cultural Heritage: comparative analysis at Iberian and European context  
Oliveira, M. D. & Ribeiro, J. T.  
1091
Contents

Golden ages and green/black valleys: a patrimony of landscapes, memories, and testimonies for a modern Wales
Osborne, B.

The Agustina Bessa-Luis web-museum: characters from Agustina
Ponce de León, I. & Linu, S.

The integration of accessibility devices in the environments of World Heritage sites
Pazuelo, M.; Merino, L.; Val, M. & Guit, J.

Religious art in India: its importance, the empathic apathy and the future. Cultural aspects concerning conservation
Ras, M.

Processes of 'patrimonialization' of culture and nature. Socio-economic use of cultural heritage in a Natural Park
Rogé Ventura, X

The uses of cultural heritage in Catalonia: the history reenactment as way of preservation, exhibition and local development
Rojas Rabaseda, A.

Sustaining cultural identity and a sense of place – new wine in old bottles or old wine in new bottles?
Russel, J. G.; Smith, A. J. & Leverton, P. J.

Between sacred and secular: heritage and the church in Italy
Ryde, J.

The soup noodle, menrui, as an important intangible heritage in Japan
Sekine, S.

Crossing the line – sustainability and large working object conservation in museums and heritage collections
Snelson, Y. & Morris, S.

Dynamics and dilemmas in the sustainable development of Sukak World Heritage Cultural Landscape (Nigeria)
Stern, J. A.

Public art as public memory: representing the heritage of mining communities
Thomas-Cumming, A. C.

Historic urban landscape. Contribution to the critical reading of the cultural territories
Trinidad-Chagos, M. A. N.

Zaraia.com: Cultural landscape as a framework for integrating sustainable economic futures, heritage and language preservation
Uría, J. & Errekeno, J.

The cultural heritage of religious spaces: the case of Santarém
Vilades, A. L.

Individual architectural merit, collective urban presence: mapping the fading post-war cityscape of Taipei, Taiwan
Wang, Y.-W. & Heath, T.
Changing paradigms: building sustainable communities by moving away from the representation of identity towards a practice of cross-cultural heritage
Witcomb, A.

Chapter 6 - Heritage and Society

Sustainable development and malaria illness experience among nigerian nomads
Akeogu, O.

The fisherman’s protective union of Newfoundland: is there a place for the heritage of the dispossessed?
Ashworth, A.

Heritage is also about demolition and disinheritance: power, ideology and popular identification in decisions about the Parlament der Republik, Berlin
Ashworth, G. J.

Accessible heritage
Bordas, M. & Uenohtzaga, M.

Ecomuseums, societies and sustainability: contrasting global experiences
Davis, P.

An analogous approach to the churches conservation problem
De Ridder, R. & De Blecqueere, S.

New social meanings and heritage significance for the military cultural landscapes in Matsu
Fu, C.-C.

Recycling heritage: on a Catalan-Spanish process
Garcia-Fuentes, J. M.

Turtle Islands: endangered species as tourism attractions in Latin America
Guerrón Montero, C.

Belonging: the contribution of heritage to sense of place
Hawke, S. K.

The Omani architectural heritage - identity and continuity
Hegazy, S. M.

Public visit to built heritage: a necessity
Jaramillo Montilla, A.; Ruiz Jamilillo, J.; Mascort Albea, E.; Mascort Albea, M. A. & Mascort Giménez, E.

Traditional industrial landscape of Sambhar, Rajasthan
Jobri, S.

History is not just stories: a proposal for an operative use of popular architectural heritage
Jorge, P. F.

Sustainability in world heritage and urban regeneration: the case of Bath
Kelsey, J. M. & Roberts, A. H.

Safeguarding of the Portuguese heritage: the case study of Safi Cathedral, Morocco
Ramos, L. F.; Sturm, T.; Lourenço, P. B.; Campos, J.; Ramos, A. & Maques, P.
Contents

The cultural significance of World Heritage Site: a case study of Victoria Terminus, Mumbai, India
Samel, S.  
1405

Hidden heritage, disappearing legacy: Jews and the politics of memory in the post-ottoman city
Segin, P. D.  
1413

Alienation from the cultural heritage
Tsigev, T. & Kancheva, I.  
1419

Vanishing frugality: loss of sustainability
Varna, S. K.  
1431

Index of Authors  
1441
ABSTRACT: The Carbide Mill in central Ottawa and the Old Swan Brewery in Perth are notable industrial heritage sites, the former because of the technological discoveries that occurred there and the latter for the quality of its architecture. In the late twentieth century, and following the cessation of industrial operations, both abandoned buildings became the sites of occupations by Indigenous groups. While the Canadian occupations in particular were related to wider social issues, in both cases the protestors claimed special affiliations with the sites upon which these buildings had been erected. In Perth and in Ottawa there was a degree of public acknowledgement of both the Indigenous and the industrial heritage claims, but the ways in and the extent to which these acknowledgements have subsequently been translated into more concrete reality have differed significantly. In Perth, the redevelopment of the brewery into luxury apartments, offices and eating places includes no indication of the Indigenous significance of the site. However, the state government has worked with local Indigenous and philanthropic organizations to develop a trail through the parkland surrounding the brewery site and local Aborigines lead interpretative tours through the area. In Ottawa, plans for a multicultural meeting place adjacent to the mill have been on the books for several decades and, in the interim, an Indigenous cultural tourism venture has been allowed to operate on the site. This presentation will consider how, following frequently acrimonious confrontations, varying accommodations have been or are being achieved for very different heritages.

INTRODUCTION

Ciniun et al. (2000, 17) contend that “heritage is part of the past which we select in the present for contemporary purposes, be they economic, cultural, political or social”. However the “we” does selecting in the case of large scale or high profile heritage sites or objects is not necessarily representative of all the groups who may feel that they have a stake in these sites or objects. Where there is dissonance (Tunbridge and Ashworth, 1996) or contestation (Jones and Shaw, 1997) over the heritage significance of a major site or object, conflict may ensue with the aims and issues of heritage significance to one group being privileged while those of value to other groups are downplayed or obliterated. The dynaming of the Buddhist statues in the Bamiyan valley of Afghanistan by Islamic fundamentalists in 2001 is a particularly graphic recent example. One context in which there is inherent potential for heritage contestation is that of settler societies, where the heritages of various Indigenous and settler groups are frequently coexistent if not necessarily co-existent (Anderson, 2000; Jones and Birdsall-Jones, 2008).

In this paper, we consider two instances of heritage contestation between Indigenous and settler groups over sites and buildings in the centres of the (post)colonial cities of Perth in Australia and Ottawa in Canada. In both cases, derelict nineteenth century industrial buildings with alleged settler heritage significance (architectural in Perth, technological in Ottawa) were sited either on or close to natural sites of alleged cultural heritage significance to certain Indigenous
groups. Also in both cases, these buildings were occupied by groups of (predominantly) indigenous protesters seeking to establish either their rights to the sites or wider social and political recognition or both. However, the accommodations between the heritage claims of the indigenous and settler groups at both sites are more diverse and are still ongoing. Therefore, although we have commented on these issues more extensively in an earlier publication (Jones and Bushell-Jones, 2003), we see some merit in bringing these stories up to date and in providing something of a retrospective on the two disputes. In the remainder of this paper we will treat the sites separately, summarizing the indigenous and the settler heritage claims and tracing the history of the heritage conflicts and of their partial and/or incomplete resolution before drawing some comparisons between them.

2 THE OLD SWAN BREWERY SITE, SWAN RIVER, PERTH, AUSTRALIA

The Swan Brewery was built in an embayment on the steep northern bank of the Swan River approximately a kilometre downstream from the current site of the Perth Central Business District. Prior to European settlement, this area, which they termed Goominnum, had both socioeconomic and spiritual significance for the local Nyungar Aboriginal people (Vinnicombe, 1988). The Swan River and the surrounding bushland offered valuable food sources for the Nyungar and, although the river estuary is saline at this point, there was a freshwater spring at the foot of the slope. This site was therefore suitable for camping, hunting and gathering. The site’s spiritual significance relates to its location on a dreaming track related to the Waugul, a mythological serpent and creator being associated with water courses. In different versions of the creation stories, the Waugul either entered or left the river at this point. A large rock at the site was considered to be the Waugul’s egg. This was removed by early European settlers and its current site realignments are unknown.

Because of the site’s economic and spiritual importance, it became a seasonal camping site and a location for teaching and initiation ceremonies. The precise locations for these activities are not known and, in the case of the teaching and initiation sites, this knowledge would have been restricted to initiated and gender specific Nyungar subgroups only. However, it is likely that the social and camping sites would have been closer to the spring and the river (i.e. the present brewery site) while the spiritual and initiation sites would have been in the more secluded, forested valleys on the steep river slope.

Aboriginal people were noted at the site by Dutch and French explorers in the late seventeenth and early nineteenth centuries respectively. However, European settlement did not occur until 1829 when Lieutenant Governor James Stirling designated Perth as the capital of the newly founded Swan River Colony. Although the local Aborigines left Goominnum as British soldiers camped at the site in 1829, several returned there in the 1830s. As a response to escalating violence between the Nyungars, who were being deprived of their hunting grounds and the early settlers, who were appropriating these lands for farming, Stirling designated Goominnum as the “Mount Eliza Native Institution.” This reserve accommodated about 50 Nyungar in the mid 1830s but, by 1838, most had either died or moved away. For a while, a Nyungar visited the former “Interpreter” of the Institution at his house in Perth. But, following complaints from his neighbours, “increasingly stringent measures were introduced culminating in legislation which forbade Aboriginal people to enter the City of Perth without written permission” (Vinnicombe, 1989:25). Since this legislation was not repealed until 1954, Nyungar people had their access to Goominnum restricted for over a century.

The presence of river access for transport and the freshwater spring made Goominnum a desirable location for the early British settlers. It was used as a shipyard before it became the native Institution and afterwards it housed a sawmill, a flour mill, a convict hiring depot and an old men’s home before the first brewery was built in 1879. The Swan Brewery Company took over operations in 1888 and in the 1890s, at the height of the Western Australian gold rush, commissioned leading local and British architects to design a much larger new building, which was completed in 1897. The new brewery was recognized as ‘state of the art’ facility and was featured in the London Brewers Journal of 1902 (Welborn, 1987). As most industrial buildings, it underwent modifications over time, but the major external structures remained largely unchanged since 1979.

Although the brewery was closed in 1980 due to the City of Perth’s 1979 resolution to clear the area, the building remains intact. At the time of writing, the entire site was in the process of being restored. In 2010, the brewery was recognized as an important cultural and architectural asset by the State Government and, in early 2010, its restoration began.

More recently, the brewery has been recognized as an important example of Australian industrial heritage and as a significant cultural asset.

3 THE CAPE PORSE BREWERY SITE, PITTPAT, ONTARIO, CANADA

Victoria is now the capital of the province of Ontario and its population has grown significantly since the 1800s. The Porse Brewery was established in 1868 by a local man, John Porse, and continued to operate until 1921. During this period, it was one of the largest and most successful breweries in the province. The site was designated a heritage site in 1992 and the brewery building was restored in 2003.

The brewery was used as a social centre for the local community, hosting dances and other events. It has also been used as a museum and as a venue for cultural events. The site is now managed by the Provincial Museum of Ontario and continues to attract visitors from all over the province.
lately enclosed under, until brewing ceased at the site in 1966 and the company finally relocated in 1979.

Although a local Nyungar elder had called for the property to be bought by the state and turned into an Aboriginal Cultural Centre in 1978, the brewery was sold to a local developer in 1980. For several years thereafter successive redevelopment proposals for the site were rejected by the City of Perth Planning Committee, largely at the instigation of lobby groups who wished to preserve the building demolished and the resultant open space (re)integrated into the surrounding Kings Park. In 1985, the State government purchased the site and, having failed to interest any commercial operators in a public-private partnership, it commenced its own redevelopment of the brewery buildings including "a small tavern, theatre and the usual food and retail outlets" (The West Australian, June 20, 1988).

At the same time, elements of the Nyungar community made formal and informal appeals to the Town Planning Appeals Tribunal and to several state ministers for the demolition of the brewery and the preservation of the site as open space in acknowledgement of its Indigenous significance. When these appeals all failed, Aboriginal groups occupied the construction site during the workers' absence over the Christmas-New Year break in 1988-9. Many non-Indigenous bodies including church groups and trade unions supported and even joined the occupation and in protest the building work was obtained. Finally, in a major and sometimes violent operation involving over one hundred police, the protesters were physically removed from the site in October 1989.

For some time thereafter, battles over the brewery raged in the courts. In 1991, the Full Court held that building work could resume. In 1993 the Heritage Council designated the brewery as a place of cultural heritage value, both for its buildings and for its Indigenous significance. In 1995 the state government granted a major construction company a 65 year lease on the property and its redevelopment, as a mixture of offices, luxury apartments and restaurants, was finally completed in 2002. The redevelopment adhered strictly to the Heritage Council's architectural guidelines and the building's (settler) industrial heritage is widely acknowledged in heritage exhibits, photographs, signage and marketing. A recent student exercise found that there remains no acknowledgement of the Indigenous significance of the site could be identified on, nor around the building (Dr. Nancy Hudson-Rodd, Edith Cowan University, pers. comm. 2010).

Small Indigenous protests occurred outside the building following its completion, initially on a weekly basis and, for several years, on such occasions as Australia Day and Invasion Day.

More recently, however, the Indigenous heritage of the wider area has been much more extensively acknowledged in and beside the Lotterywest Federation Walkway which was opened immediately upstream from the Brewery in Kings Park in 2003. (Lotterywest is a corporatised, and relatively independent, state government instrumentality which uses the profits from its lotteries for a range of charitable purposes.) Although the 620 metre long walkway was undertaken as a project to celebrate the centenary of Australian federation in 2001, there was significant Nyungar (as well as settler) input into its design and construction. It includes a Nyungar Reconciliation (performance area/meeting place), features much Nyungar artwork — including depictions of the Waager — and, in its elevated (treestop) section overlooks, if not dominates, many views of the Brewery. Furthermore, a local Nyungar group now offers Kings Park Indigenous Tours, using the bush and parkland surrounding the Brewery to demonstrate the area's Indigenous history and heritage. In this part of Perth, therefore, both the Indigenous and the (architectural) settler heritage are now acknowledged, albeit with a degree of spatial separation.

THE CARBIDE MILL, VICTORIA ISLAND, OTTAWA, CANADA

Victoria Island is part of the Asticou group of islands in the Ottawa River, very close to what is now the Ottawa city centre. The river was an important travel route for the original Algonquin inhabitants and there is archaeological evidence of a small Indigenous settlement on the south (Ontario) bank opposite Victoria Island. Asticou is the Algonquin word for a boiling pot or kettle (Bond, 1968) and was the original name of the waterfall located between Victoria Island and the north (Quebec) bank of the river. This site, like Gooninimup, had Indigenous spiritual significance and, in 1613, the French explorer, Champlain, described ceremonies in which the Al-
gonquin made offerings to the spirit of the falls which he named, in a direct translation, Chaudiere (Kennedy, 1970: 9).

For several centuries following first contact, the Native American tribes of this region were partially co-opted by the Europeans, first into the lucrative fur trade and then into the colonial wars between the British and the French. The colonial authorities therefore sought to maintain good relations with the Indigenous groups to secure their cooperation in the fur trade and following American independence, their assistance in hostilities with the USA.

With the demise of the fur trade and the end of the War of 1812, the colonial economy shifted to farming and timber cutting. In the nineteenth century the Algonquin and the other local tribes were gradually divested of their lands and forced onto reserves at some distance from Victoria Island and Ottawa (Huitema, 2000).

In the 1820s Captain John Le Breton acquired land on the southern bank of the river which gave him access to Victoria Island and the Chaudiere Falls (NCC, 1988). A bridge was built across the river using the Island in 1826 and, in 1829, the first of several timber slides were constructed to carry the large rafts of logs to navigate the falls. In 1842 a dam was constructed for the harness the water power, initially for a saw mill, and, by mid-century, the island group had become "the industrial heartland of Ottawa" (Darcy, 2000:1).

In 1857, Ottawa was designated as the capital of Canada and impressive Parliament buildings were constructed on a bluff overlooking Victoria Island by 1866. In spite of this, the island remained as an industrial area and, in 1900, Thomas Willson, the inventor of a process for the mass production of carbide opened a carbide mill on Victoria Island (http://www.canadacapital.gc.ca/bins/ncc_web_content_npg.asp?cid=16300-20450-27515-27616&lang=1&hnp=1, Accessed April 30, 2010). However, this occurred towards the end of the islands' industrial era. The Federal District Planning Commission (precursor of the current National Capital Commission) began purchasing property on Victoria Island in 1910; many of the industrial buildings became warehouses and, from mid-century, many were cleared to create "landscaped green space" (Darcy, 2000:5). The former carbide mill, by this time one of the few remaining industrial structures, was designated as part of the Canadian National Estate, both as an example of industrial heritage and as the site of notable technological advances.

In 1975, the first Indigenous occupation of the site occurred after the Native People's Caravan, which had progressed across the country from Vancouver, was displaced from its proposed site on Parliament Hill. The protestors invaded the boarded up carbide mill and remained for from September 1975 to February 1976. The mill was also used as the (eventual) site of further Aboriginal protests against the federal government. The first, in 1990, was an offshoot of an Indigenous protest and occupation at Oka near Montreal. A much more protracted occupation occurred from 1995-1999. This involved the Assembly of First Nations, a group of tribes from across Canada, which was protesting about land claims. In all three cases the protesters moved from Parliament House/Parliament Hill to Victoria Island/the carbide mill, both the political significance of being in a visible location close to the Parliament and the cultural and spiritual significance of the proximity to the Chaudiere Falls.

The first group of protesters was evicted from the carbide mill after a period of harassment by the police and the city council, which included the withdrawal of water and electricity during the Canadian winter. Possibly because of this - at least in part - wider government acknowledgment of Indigenous concerns and Indigenous heritage on Victoria Island became apparent early as 1977. In that year, the National Capital Commission produced a report on the entire area of the capital city, with particular reference to the island, which noted that:

"the ethnic and cultural diversity which typifies Canadians should be portrayed. The indigenous native peoples and those minorities not now adequately represented should be adequately featured, as should their relationship to regional and geographical areas. This passive image of Canada past, present and future may complement an active form where individuals may display and/or debate National issues. The above activities may be developed inside or in the vicinity of the Carbide building. Small ancillary commercial functions may also be encouraged in the area such as cafes, craft shops etc." (NCC, 1977: 57)

This recommendation has been built on in subsequent plans and reports (NCC, 1988:200; 2005). Indeed, the 2000 publication contains architect's drawings of a "Proposed Architectural Statement" (NCC, 2000: 15) to be constructed on the site. To date, however, the rhetoric has not been matched by reality. Even though the 1977 report had recommended that the government....
should "begin development of the Eastern portion of Victoria Island as soon as possible" (NCC, 1897, 50), the carbide mill remains a ruin and the cultural centre is still no more than an architect's drawing.

In spite of these delays, in Ottawa as in Perth, a largely unrelated development has led to the plight of an Indigenous heritage experience at the Eastern end of Victoria Island adjacent to the carbide mill. In 1986, the Ottawa Native Friendship Centre (which is part of a national network of non-profit, non-political organizations which aim to provide services for Aboriginal people regardless of their tribal affiliations) sponsored the establishment of the Turtle Island Tourism Company. This group initially organized Indigenous performances and displays for school tourists and community events. When the third occupation of the carbide mill ended in 1989, they negotiated with the National Capital Commission to set up an Aboriginal Experience Village (with a stockade, teepees, canoe building and other displays) at the Eastern end of Victoria Island. This venture has been operating successfully for more than a decade and has been the recipient of several regional tourism awards.

4 The Brewery and the Carbide Mill: Similarities and Differences

Both buildings and their co-located Indigenous spiritual sites are on-or in-rivers and are adjacent to their respective city centres. The time lines of the two case studies are impressively similar. First contact between Europeans and the Indigenous populations took place in the seventeenth century. Although interaction between Europeans and the Aboriginal population was not present in the intervening period in the Canadian case, both Perth and Ottawa were first codified towns in the 1820s. Construction of the brewery was completed in 1897 and of the carbide mill in 1900, with industrial production occurring for several decades at each site. The acquisition of the carbide mill (1975-1976, 1990 and 1995-1999) spanned that at the brewery 1897-1900. The Indigenous heritage significance of Victoria Island/the Claudiere Falls was firstly acknowledged in 1977 and that of the brewery site in 1992. Both buildings were also listed for their industrial significance at around the same time. An Indigenous (heritage) tourism operation commenced at Victoria Island in 1999, while the (partly) Indigenous pedestrian walkway was opened in Kings Park above the brewery in 2003, with an Indigenous tourism operation commencing shortly thereafter. Construction of an Aboriginal Cultural Centre on Victoria Island has been proposed since 1977, though construction has yet to commence. The two brewery buildings as an Aboriginal Cultural Centre was first suggested in 1978 but this plan was not realized. Much more recently, an Indigenous Cultural Centre has been proposed for the Perth waterfront, a short distance upstream from the brewery. A business case for both waterfront redevelopments, including the Indigenous cultural centre, will be presented in 2010.

The chronological similarities are all the more notable given the varied geographical, political, and cultural contexts in which these events occurred. In geographical terms, although a variety of industrial activities took place on the small embayment that was the brewery site for 1 century, the slopes surrounding it remained under natural bushland until 1872 when the area was designated as Perth Park. It was renamed Kings Park in 1901 and has remained as one of the city's most popular recreational areas ever since. The industrial brewery buildings were noticeably seen by many as at best a local anomaly and at worst as "that unsightly collection of dilapidated buildings" (Welborn, 1987: 206) on the riverfront and thus as being worthy of demolition. For this reason a number of "establishment" settler groups concurred and even colluded with elements of the Nyungar population in calling for the brewery buildings' removal.

In contrast, the Carbide Mill was located in the centre of Ottawa's main industrial area and removal of the structures surrounding it and their gradual replacement with parkland has been a much more recent process and was not such a controversial issue for the local community.

In political terms, Victoria Island is not merely in a central city foreshore location, it is a component of "Canada's Capital Core Area". Given the tensions between "English" and "French" Canada, it is symbolically significant that this area encompasses both the Ontario and Québec banks of the river and contains such national institutions as Parliament House, the Canadian Museum of Civilization and the Supreme Court. This area is therefore controlled and managed by the National Capital Commission which seeks to ensure that "the ethnic and cultural
diversity which typifies Canadians should be portrayed” therein (NCC, 1977:57). Even though three occupations of the caribou mill have taken place, the NCC has had a consistent, culturally inclusive and, it would seem, uncontroversial plan for this area for a third of a century. No such consistency or harmony has been evident in Perth. The brewery redevelopment (or its denial) and a series of plans for the redevelopment of the wider Perth waterfront have been divisive issues within Western Australia for decades. The battle lines have variously been drawn between the City of Perth and the Western Australian state government, between conservationists and “Friends” of the park and the waterfront against architects, developers and those advocating more “life” for the riverfront and between the Labor and Liberal/National (i.e. conservative) parties at state level. Not surprisingly therefore the fate of the brewery has been repeatedly contested in the City Council’s planning committee, in state parliament and in the courts and the planning policies for the brewery and for the wider Perth waterfront have changed repeatedly, following elections, parliamentary votes and court rulings.

Culturally, the major contrasts relate to the nature of the Indigenous involvement in both disputes. In Perth, the issue of the brewery’s retention or demolition was highly controversial within the settler community and in the Indigenous community, where the primary cultural loyalties of the Nyungar population are to extremely small clan/skin groups. Furthermore, that a century of Indigenous exclusion from the site, it was unclear which of these family groups could legitimately claim any cultural authority over the brewery site and its surrounds and the (pro-demolition) Indigenous leader of the occupation of the building site was a controversial and even a divisive, figure within the local Aboriginal community. In these circumstances, different elements of the Nyungar population either allied themselves with or were co-opted into both pro- and anti-demolition settler groups (Jones, 1997). In Canada, where treaties between the settlers and the native populations were the norm, one Algonquin group was clearly the Indigenous stakeholder for Victoria Island. Even though both the occupations of the caribou and the operation of the Aboriginal Experiences Village involved a range of Indigenous groups from all over Canada and, on occasion, from the USA, the Algonquin elders were able to negotiate successful outcomes ranging from a peaceful end to the final occupation to the management of a multi-tribal tourist operation.

5 CONCLUSION

In different ways, both industrial and Indigenous heritages lie beyond the cultural – certainly the high cultural – mainstream. It is therefore notable that they have both been acknowledged in high profile sites in the centre of these two major colonial cities. Nevertheless it must be acknowledged that it is the settler, industrial heritages that have – to date – been most evident and formally accepted. The Aboriginal Cultural Centres in Perth and Ottawa are still no more than plans and promises more than three decades on from their first conceptualizations. The Aboriginal Experiences Village is a temporary leasehold operation and the Federation Way is a philanthropic, rather than a government, initiative and was originally conceived to mark an important settler heritage milestone. In time in Ottawa and in space in Perth the official acknowledgement of Indigenous heritages have somewhat distanced from the sites at which the Indigenous protests occurred.

REFERENCES

Darcy, S. 2000. An historical investigation concerning the National Capital Commission’s intervention process upon the cultural landscape of Victoria Island. Report prepared for a seminar delivered at the National Archives of Canada.


